



Dave Yost • Auditor of State



Dave Yost • Auditor of State

INDEPENDENT ACCOUNTANTS' REPORT ON APPLYING AGREED-UPON PROCEDURES

Butler Township
Columbiana County
P.O. Box 102
Winona, Ohio 44493

We have performed the procedures enumerated below, which were agreed to by the Board of Trustees and the management of Butler Township (the Township) and the Auditor of State, on the receipts, disbursements and balances recorded in the Township's cash basis accounting records for the years ended December 31, 2017 and 2016 and certain compliance requirements related to those transactions and balances, included in the information provided to us by the management of the Township. The Township is responsible for the receipts, disbursements and balances recorded in the cash basis accounting records for the years ended December 31, 2017 and 2016 and certain compliance requirements related to these transactions and balances included in the information provided to us by the Township. The sufficiency of the procedures is solely the responsibility of the parties specified in this report.

Consequently, we make no representation regarding the sufficiency of the procedures described below either for the purpose for which this report has been requested or for any other purpose.

This report only describes exceptions exceeding \$10.

Cash

1. We recalculated the December 31, 2017 and December 31, 2016 bank reconciliations. We found no exceptions.
2. We agreed the January 1, 2016 beginning fund balances recorded in the Fund Ledger Report to the December 31, 2015 balances in the documentation in the prior year Agreed-Upon Procedures working papers. We found no exceptions. We also agreed the January 1, 2017 beginning fund balances recorded in the Fund Ledger Report to the December 31, 2016 balances in the Fund Ledger Report. We found no exceptions.
3. We agreed the totals per the bank reconciliations to the total of the December 31, 2017 and 2016 fund cash balances reported in the Fund Status Report. The amounts agreed.
4. We confirmed the December 31, 2017 bank account balances with the Township's financial institution. We found no exceptions. We also agreed the confirmed balances to the amounts appearing in the December 31, 2017 bank reconciliation without exception.
5. We selected five reconciling debits (such as outstanding checks) haphazardly from the December 31, 2017 bank reconciliation:
 - a. We traced each debit to the subsequent January bank statement. We found no exceptions.
 - b. We traced the amounts and dates to the check register, to determine the debits were dated prior to December 31. There were no exceptions.

6. We traced interbank account transfers occurring in December of 2017 and 2016 to the accounting records and bank statements to determine if they were properly recorded. We found no exceptions.

Property Taxes, Intergovernmental and Other Confirmable Cash Receipts

1. We haphazardly selected a property tax receipt from one *Statement of Semiannual Apportionment of Taxes* (the *Statement*) for 2017 and one from 2016:
 - a. We traced the gross receipts from the *Statement* to the amount recorded in the Revenue Ledger. We also traced the advances noted on the *Statement* to the Revenue Ledger. The amounts agreed.
 - b. We inspected the Revenue Ledger to confirm the receipt was allocated to the proper fund(s) as required by Ohio Rev. Code Sections 5705.05-.06 and 5705.10. We found no exceptions.
 - c. We inspected the Revenue Ledger to confirm whether the receipt was recorded in the proper year. The receipt was recorded in the proper year.
2. We inspected the Revenue Ledger to determine whether it included two real estate tax receipts plus three advances for 2017 and three advances for 2016. The Revenue Ledger included the proper number of tax receipts for each year.
3. We haphazardly selected five receipts from the State Distribution Transaction Lists (DTL) from 2017 and five from 2016. We also haphazardly selected five receipts from the County Auditor's Cross Reference by Vendor Number report from 2017 and five from 2016.
 - a. We compared the amount from the above reports to the amount recorded in the Receipt Register Report. The amounts agreed.
 - b. We inspected the Receipt Register Report to determine that these receipts were allocated to the proper funds. We found no exceptions.
 - c. We inspected the Receipt Register Report to determine whether the receipts were recorded in the proper year. We found no exceptions.

Debt

1. From the prior agreed-upon procedures documentation, we observed the following loans were outstanding as of December 31, 2015. The 2016 beginning balances on the Schedule of Outstanding Debt did not agree to the ending balances for the 2012 Truck Loan, Property Loan or the Loader Loan.

Issue	Principal outstanding as of December 31, 2015:
Property Loan	\$20,836.99
Loader Loan	\$36,844.84
Road Chip Loan	\$100,000
2012 Truck Loan	\$0

2. We inquired of management, and inspected the Receipt Register Report and Payment Register Detail Report for evidence of debt issued during 2017 or 2016 or debt payment activity during 2017 or 2016. The Township issued a loan for \$116,456.80 during 2016 which was properly included on the 2016 Schedule of Outstanding Debt. However, the 2017 and 2016 Schedule of Outstanding Debt did not agree to debt payment activity during the year.

3. We obtained a summary of loan debt activity for 2017 and 2016 and agreed principal and interest payments from the related debt amortization schedules to General and Road District fund payments reported in the Payment Register Detail Report. We also compared the date the debt service payments were due to the date the Township made the payments. All debt payments were made in a timely manner. Principal and interest payments did not agree between the debt schedule and payment register detail report.
4. We agreed the amount of debt proceeds from the debt documents to amounts recorded in the Road District fund per the Receipt Register Report. The amounts agreed. The Township recorded the proceeds of the debt in the Road District fund as Other Financing Sources rather than Other Debt Proceeds.
5. For new debt issued during 2016, we inspected the debt legislation, which stated the Township must use the proceeds to purchase a Cab Tractor and a Machete Boom Mower. We inspected the Payment Register Detail Report and observed the Township purchased a Cab Tractor in October of 2016 and a Machete Boom Mower in November of 2016.

Payroll Cash Disbursements

1. We haphazardly selected one payroll check for five employees from 2017 and one payroll check for five employees from 2016 from the Wage Detail Report and:
 - a. We compared the hours and pay rate, or salary recorded in the Wage Detail Report to supporting documentation (timecard, legislatively or statutorily-approved rate or salary). We found one instance where an employee was not paid for 11.5 hours of overtime at the approved overtime rate. We brought this to management's attention, and payment was included with the June 1, 2018 payroll. Because we did not compare all timecards, our report provides no assurance whether or not other similar errors occurred.
 - b. We inspected the fund and account code(s) to which the check was posted to determine the posting was reasonable based on the employees' duties as documented in the employees' personnel files and/or minute record or as required by statute. We also confirmed the payment was posted to the proper year. We found no exceptions.
2. For any new employees selected in procedure 1 we inspected the employees' personnel files and/or minute record for the following information and compared it with the information used to compute gross and net pay related to this check:
 - a. Name
 - b. Authorized salary or pay rate
 - c. Department(s) and fund(s) to which the check should be charged
 - d. Retirement system participation and payroll withholding
 - e. Federal, State & Local income tax withholding authorization and withholding
 - f. Any other deduction authorizations (deferred compensation, etc.)

We found no exceptions related to procedures a. – f. above.

3. We inspected the last remittance of tax and retirement withholdings for the year ended December 31, 2017 to confirm remittances were timely paid, and if the amounts paid agreed to the amounts withheld, plus the employer's share where applicable, during the final withholding period of 2017. We observed the following:

Withholding (plus employer share, where applicable)	Date Due	Date Paid	Amount Due	Amount Paid
Federal income taxes & Medicare (and social security, for employees not enrolled in pension system)	January 31, 2018	December 31, 2017	\$3,766.26	\$3,766.26
State income taxes	January 15, 2018	December 31, 2017	\$687.97	\$687.97
OPERS retirement	January 30, 2018	December 31, 2017	\$4,333.29	\$4,333.29

4. We inquired of management and inspected the Payment Register Detail Report for the years ended December 31, 2017 and 2016 to determine if Township employees and/or trustees were reimbursed for out-of-pocket insurance premiums. No such reimbursements occurred.

Non-Payroll Cash Disbursements

1. We haphazardly selected ten disbursements from the Payment Register Detail Report for the year ended December 31, 2017 and ten from the year ended 2016 and determined whether:
 - a. The disbursements were for a proper public purpose. We found no exceptions.
 - b. The check number, date, payee name and amount recorded on the returned, canceled check agreed to the check number, date, payee name and amount recorded in the Payment Register Detail Report and to the names and amounts on the supporting invoices. We found no exceptions.
 - c. The payment was posted to a fund consistent with the restricted purpose for which the fund's cash can be used. We found no exceptions.
 - d. The fiscal officer certified disbursements requiring certification or issued a Then and Now Certificate, as required by Ohio Rev. Code Section 5705.41(D). We found seven instances where the certification date was after the vendor invoice date, and there was also no evidence that a Then and Now Certificate was issued. Ohio Rev. Code Section 5705.41(D) requires certifying at the time of a commitment, which should be on or before the invoice date, unless a Then and Now Certificate is used. Because we did not inspect all disbursements requiring certification, our report provides no assurance whether or not additional similar errors occurred.

Compliance – Budgetary

1. We compared the total estimated receipts from the Amended Official Certificate of Estimated Resources, required by Ohio Rev. Code Section 5705.36(A)(1), to the amounts recorded in the Revenue Status Report for the General, Road and Bridge and Fire Levy funds for the years ended December 31, 2017 and 2016. The amounts agreed.
2. We inspected the appropriation measures adopted for 2017 and 2016 to determine whether, for the General, Road and Bridge and Fire Levy funds, the Trustees appropriated separately for “each office, department, and division, and within each, the amount appropriated for personal services,” as is required by Ohio Rev. Code Section 5705.38(C). We found no exceptions.
3. We compared total appropriations required by Ohio Rev. Code Sections 5705.38 and 5705.40, to the amounts recorded in the Appropriation Status Report for 2017 and 2016 for the following funds: General, Road and Bridge and Fire Levy Funds. The amounts on the appropriation resolutions agreed to the amounts recorded in the Appropriation Status Report for 2016 but did not agree to amounts recorded in the Appropriation Status Report for 2017.

The Board approved final appropriations of \$257,460 for the General Fund, \$204,830 for the Road and Bridge Fund and \$170,395 for the Fire Levy Fund. Final Appropriations recorded in the accounting system were \$247,245, \$173,200 and \$169,100, respectively. The Fiscal Officer should periodically compare amounts recorded in the Appropriation Status Report to amounts approved by the Board to assure they agree. If the amounts do not agree, Trustees may be using inaccurate information for budgeting and monitoring purposes.

4. Ohio Rev. Code Sections 5705.36(A)(5) and 5705.39 prohibits appropriations from exceeding the certified resources. We compared total appropriations to total certified resources for the General, Road and Bridge and Fire Levy funds for the years ended December 31, 2017 and 2016. There were no funds for which appropriations exceeded certified resources.
5. Ohio Rev. Code Section 5705.41(B) prohibits expenditures (disbursements plus certified commitments) from exceeding appropriations. We compared total expenditures to total appropriations for the years ended December 31, 2017 and 2016 for the General, Road and Bridge and Fire Levy fund, as recorded in the Appropriation Status Report. There were no funds for which expenditures exceeded appropriations.
6. Ohio Rev. Code Section 5705.09 requires establishing separate funds to segregate externally-restricted resources. We inspected the Receipt Register Report for evidence of new restricted receipts requiring a new fund during December 31, 2017 and 2016. We also inquired of management regarding whether the Township received new restricted receipts. We observed no evidence of new restricted receipts for which Ohio Rev. Code Section 5705.09 would require the Township to establish a new fund.
7. For funds existing in prior years, inspect the fund activity to determine whether the fund is still being used for the statutorily approved purpose and that all the required funds were established. All the required funds were established and no funds for which the statutorily approved purpose was no longer valid were included on the accounting records.
8. We inspected the 2017 and 2016 Revenue Status Reports, Appropriation Status Reports and Interfund Transfer Listing for evidence of interfund transfers which Ohio Rev. Code Sections 5705.14 - .16 restrict. We found no evidence of transfers in 2017 or 2016.
9. We inquired of management and inspected the Appropriation Status Reports to determine whether the Township elected to establish reserve accounts permitted by Ohio Rev. Code Section 5705.13. The Township did not establish these reserves.
10. We inspected the Cash Summary by Fund Report for the years ended December 31, 2017 and 2016 for negative cash fund balances. Ohio Rev. Code Section 5705.10 (l) provides that money paid into a fund must be used for the purposes for which such fund is established. As a result, a negative fund cash balance indicates that money from one fund was used to cover the expenses of another. No funds had a negative cash fund balances.

Compliance – Contracts & Expenditures

We inquired of management and inspected the Payment Register Detail Report for the years ended December 31, 2017 and 2016 to determine if the Township proceeded by force account (i.e. used its own employees) to maintain or repair roads (cost of project \$15,000-\$45,000) or to construct or reconstruct township roads (cost of project \$5,000-\$15,000/per mile) for which Ohio Rev. Code Section 5575.01 requires the county engineer to complete a force account project assessment form (i.e., cost estimate). We identified no projects requiring the county engineer to complete a force account cost estimate.

Other Compliance

1. Ohio Rev. Code Section 117.38 requires townships to file their financial information in the HINKLE system within 60 days after the close of the fiscal year. This statute also permits the Auditor of State to extend the deadline for filing a financial report and establish terms and conditions for any such extension. Auditor of State established policies, in addition to filing extensions granted for extenuating circumstances, allow for refiling complete financial statements, as defined in AOS Bulletin 2015-007 in the Hinkle System for December 31, 2017 and 2016 fiscal year ends included in 2015-2016 or 2016-2017 agreed up on procedure engagements, subsequent to the Township's deadline where the initial filing was filed on time but incomplete. We confirmed the Township filed their complete financial statements, as defined by AOS Bulletin 2015-007 and Auditor of State established policy, within the allotted timeframe for the years ended December 31, 2017 and 2016 in the Hinkle system. Per review of the HINKLE System, financial information for 2016 was filed on February 17, 2017 which was within the due date. Financial information for 2017 was filed on March 5, 2018 which was not within the allotted timeframe.
2. We inquired of the fiscal officer and inspected the Fiscal Integrity Act Portal (<http://www.ohioauditor.gov/fiscalintegrity/default.html>) to determine whether the fiscal officer obtained the training required by Ohio Rev. Code Section 507.12 and 733.81. Fiscal Officer obtained the required training.

This agreed-upon procedures engagement was conducted in accordance with the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants attestation standards and applicable attestation engagement standards included in the Comptroller General of the United States' Government Auditing Standards. We were not engaged to, and did not conduct an examination or review, the objective of which would be the expression of an opinion or conclusion, respectively, on the Township's receipts, disbursements, balances and compliance with certain laws and regulations. Accordingly, we do not express an opinion or conclusion. Had we performed additional procedures, other matters might have come to our attention that would have been reported to you.

This report is to provide assistance in the evaluation of the Township's receipts, disbursements and balances recorded in their cash-basis accounting records for the years ended December 31, 2017 and 2016, and certain compliance requirements related to these transactions and balances and is not suitable for any other purpose.



Dave Yost
Auditor of State

Columbus, Ohio

June 1, 2018



Dave Yost • Auditor of State

BUTLER TOWNSHIP

COLUMBIANA COUNTY

CLERK'S CERTIFICATION

This is a true and correct copy of the report which is required to be filed in the Office of the Auditor of State pursuant to Section 117.26, Revised Code, and which is filed in Columbus, Ohio.

Susan Babbitt

CLERK OF THE BUREAU

**CERTIFIED
JUNE 26, 2018**