



OHIO AUDITOR OF STATE
KEITH FABER



OHIO AUDITOR OF STATE KEITH FABER



65 East State Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
ContactUs@ohioauditor.gov
800-282-0370

INDEPENDENT ACCOUNTANT'S REPORT ON APPLYING AGREED-UPON PROCEDURES

Madison Township
Clark County
228 West Columbus Rd
South Charleston, Ohio 45368

We have performed the procedures enumerated below on the Madison Township's (the Township) receipts, disbursements and balances recorded in the cash basis accounting records for the years ended December 31, 2023 and 2022 and certain compliance requirements related to those transactions and balances, included in the information provided to us by the management of the Township. The Township is responsible for the receipts, disbursements and balances recorded in the cash basis accounting records for the years ended December 31, 2023 and 2022 and certain compliance requirements related to these transactions and balances included in the information provided to us by the Township.

The Board of Trustees and the management of the Township have agreed to and acknowledged that the procedures performed are appropriate to meet the intended purpose of providing assistance in the evaluation of the Township's receipts, disbursements and balances recorded in their cash basis accounting records for the years ended December 31, 2023 and 2022, and certain compliance requirements related to these transactions and balances. No other party acknowledged the appropriateness of the procedures. This report may not be suitable for any other purpose. The procedures performed may not address all the items of interest to a user of the report and may not meet the needs of all users of the report and, as such, users are responsible for determining whether the procedures performed are appropriate for their purposes. The sufficiency of the procedures is solely the responsibility of the parties specified in the report. Consequently, we make no representation regarding the sufficiency of the procedures described below either for the purpose for which this report has been requested or for any other purpose.

For the purposes of performing these procedures, this report only describes exceptions exceeding \$10.

The procedures and the associated findings are as follows:

Cash and Investments

1. We recalculated the December 31, 2023 and December 31, 2022 bank reconciliations. We found no exceptions.
2. We agreed the January 1, 2022 beginning fund balances for each fund recorded in the Fund Ledger Report to the December 31, 2021 balances in the prior year Agreed-Upon Procedures working papers. We noted a variance of \$268.52 due to a prior year audit adjustment and voided check. We also agreed the January 1, 2023 beginning fund balances for each fund recorded in the Fund Ledger Report to the December 31, 2022 balances in the Fund Ledger Report. We found no exceptions.
3. We agreed the 2023 and 2022 Bank Reconciliation adjusted UAN Balances and Adjusted Bank Balances as of December 31, 2023 and 2022 to the total fund cash balances reported in the Fund Status Report and the financial statements filed by the Township in the Hinkle System. The amounts agreed.

Cash and Investments (Continued)

4. We observed the year-end bank balances on the financial institution's website. The balances agreed. We also agreed the confirmed balances to the amounts appearing in the December 31, 2023 bank reconciliation without exception.
5. We selected 5 reconciling debits (such as outstanding checks) from the December 31, 2023 bank reconciliation:
 - a. We traced each debit to the subsequent January and February bank statements. Two reconciling debits could not be agreed to the subsequent bank statements.
 - b. We traced the amounts and dates to the check register, and determined the debits were dated prior to December 31. We found no exceptions.
6. We inspected the Fund Status Report to determine whether the Findings For Adjustment identified in the prior agreed-upon procedures report, due from the General fund, payable to the Debt Service fund, was properly posted to the ledgers and reflected in the fund balances in Procedure 2. We noted one exception. The \$21,245 due from the General Fund and payable to the Debt Service Fund was not posted. In the 2018-19 agreed-upon procedures, the Township transferred \$21,245 from the Debt Service Fund to the General Fund. **Ohio Rev. Code § 5705.16** does not permit this transfer without approval of the Tax Commissioner. The Township did not obtain this approval. We therefore requested management to adjust this amount to the Debt Service Fund. As of the date of this report, management has not yet made the required adjustment back to the Debt Service Fund and has declined to obtain the aforementioned required approvals. In accordance with the foregoing facts, we hereby issue a finding for adjustment against the General Fund in favor of the Debt Service Fund in the amount of \$21,245. This finding was previously issued in the prior agreed-upon procedures and is being issued again as the issue still remains.
7. We inspected investments held at December 31, 2023 and December 31, 2022 to determine that they:
 - a. Were of a type authorized by Ohio Rev. Code §§ 135.13, 135.14, 135.144 or 135.145. We found no exceptions.
 - b. Mature within the prescribed time limits noted in Ohio Rev. Code § 135.13 or 135.14. We found no exceptions.

Property Taxes, Intergovernmental and Other Confirmable Cash Receipts

1. We selected a total of 5 receipts from the *Statement of Semiannual Apportionment of Taxes*, State Distribution Transaction Lists (DTL), and the Clark County Auditor Vendor Activity Reports for 2023 and a total of 5 from 2022:
 - a. We compared the amount from the above-named reports to the amount recorded in the Receipt Export Report. The amounts agreed.
 - b. We inspected the Receipt Export Report to determine these receipts were allocated to the proper fund(s) as required by Ohio Rev. Code §§ 5705.05 and 5705.10. We found no exceptions.
 - c. We inspected the Receipt Export Report to determine whether the receipt was recorded in the proper year. The receipt was recorded in the proper year. We found no exceptions.
2. We inspected the Receipt Export Report to determine whether it included 2 real estate tax receipts plus 6 advances for 2023 and 2022. The Receipt Export Report included the proper number of tax receipts for each year. We found no exceptions.

Other Receipts

We selected 10 other receipts from the year ended December 31, 2023 and 10 other receipts from the year ended 2022 and:

- a. Agreed the receipt amount recorded in the Receipt Export Report to supporting documentation. The amounts agreed.
- b. Inspected the Receipt Export Report to determine the receipt was posted to the proper funds and was recorded in the proper year. We found one receipt of \$227.52 that was not properly allocated to the Township's funds. We brought this to management's attention. However, because we did not inspect all receipts, our report provides no assurance regarding whether or not other similar errors occurred.

Debt

- 1. From the prior agreed-upon procedures documentation, we observed the following bond and loan were outstanding as of December 31, 2021.
 - a. These amounts agreed to the Township's January 1, 2022 balances on the summary we used in procedure 3.
 - b. We inspected the debt's final offering documents for all outstanding debt, and we confirmed the Township does not have any debt covenants.

Issue	Principal outstanding as of December 31, 2021:
2018 EMS Squad Loan	\$65,000.00
2018 EMS Vehicle Bonds	\$63,978.51

- 2. We inquired of management and inspected the Receipt Export Report and Payment Export Detail Report for evidence of debt issued during 2023 or 2022 or debt payment activity during 2023 or 2022. All debt agreed to the summary we used in procedure 3. There were no new debt issuances during 2023 or 2022.
- 3. We obtained a summary of bonds and loans debt activity for 2023 and 2022 and agreed principal and interest payments from the related debt amortization schedules to Emergency Medical Transport fund payments reported in the Payment Register Detail Report. We also compared the date the debt service payments were due to the date the Township made the payments. We found no exceptions.

Payroll Cash Disbursements

- 1. We selected 1 payroll check for 5 employees from 2023 and 1 payroll check for 5 employees from 2022 from the Wage Withholdings Detail Report and:
 - a. We compared the hours and pay rate, or salary recorded in the Wage Detail Report to supporting documentation (timecard, legislatively or statutorily-approved rate or salary). We found no exceptions.
 - b. We inspected the fund and account codes to which the check was posted to determine the posting was allowable based on the employees' duties as documented in the employees' personnel files and/or minute record or as required by statute. We found no exceptions.
 - c. We confirmed the payment was posted to the proper year. We found no exceptions.

Payroll Cash Disbursements (Continued)

2. We selected the only 2 new employees and Board of Trustees from 2023 and the only 3 new employees and Board of Trustees from 2022 and:
 - a. We inspected the employees'/Board of Trustees' personnel files and/or minute record for the Retirement system, Federal, State & Local income tax withholding authorization.
 - b. We agreed the items in a above to the Employee General Information Report.
 We found no exceptions.

3. We inspected the last remittance of tax and retirement withholdings for the year ended December 31, 2023 to confirm remittances were timely paid, and if the amounts paid agreed to the amounts withheld, plus the employer's share where applicable, during the final withholding period of 2023. We observed the following:

Withholding (plus employer share, where applicable)	Date Due	Date Paid	Amount Due	Amount Paid
Federal income taxes & Medicare (and social security, for employees not enrolled in pension system)	January 31, 2024	January 9, 2024	\$1,238.10	\$1,238.10
State income taxes	January 15, 2024	January 9, 2024	\$546.71	\$546.71
Local income tax – Village of South Charleston	January 15, 2024	January 9, 2024	\$286.46	\$286.46
OPERS retirement	January 31, 2024	January 9, 2024	\$3,111.93	\$3,111.93
Northeastern Local School District tax	January 31, 2024	January 9, 2024	\$115.70	\$115.70
Southeastern Local School District tax	January 31, 2024	January 9, 2024	\$366.41	\$366.41

We found no exceptions.

4. For the pay periods ended October 31, 2023 and April 30, 2022, we
 - a. Recomputed the allocation of the Fiscal Officer's and Boards' salary amounts and employer shares withholdings the General, Motor Vehicle License Tax, Gasoline Tax, Road & Bridge, Fire District, Emergency Medical Transport, and the Permissive Motor Vehicle License Tax funds per the Wage Detail Report.
 - b. Traced the Fiscal Officer's and Boards pay for time or services performed to supporting certifications the Revised Code requires.
 We found no exceptions.

5. We compared total gross pay for the fiscal officer and each board of trustees for 2023 and 2022 to the compensation permitted by Ohio Rev. Code §§ 507.09 and 505.24, respectively. We found that the Fiscal Officer was under compensated by \$86 in 2023 and \$81 in 2022.

Non-Payroll Cash Disbursements

We selected 10 from the Payment Export Report for the year ended December 31, 2023 and 10 from the year ended 2022 and determined whether:

- a. The disbursements were for a proper public purpose. We found no exceptions.
- b. The check number, date, payee name and amount recorded on the returned, canceled check or bank statement for ACH/EFTs agreed to the check number, date, payee name and amount recorded in the Payment Export Report and to the names and amounts on the supporting invoices. We found no exceptions.

Non-Payroll Cash Disbursements (Continued)

- c. The payment was posted to a fund consistent with the restricted purpose for which the fund's cash can disbursements be used. We found no exceptions.
- d. The fiscal officer certified disbursements requiring certification or issued a *Then and Now Certificate*, as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 5705.41(D). We found three instances where the certification date was after the vendor invoice date and there was no evidence that a *Then and Now Certificate* was issued. Ohio Rev. Code § 5705.41(D) requires certifying at the time of a commitment, which should be on or before the invoice date, unless a *Then and Now Certificate* is used. Because we did not inspect all disbursements requiring certification, our report provides no assurance whether or not additional similar errors occurred.

Compliance – Budgetary

1. Ohio Rev. Code § 5705.41(B) prohibits expenditures (disbursements plus certified commitments including outstanding encumbrances) from exceeding appropriations. We compared total expenditures to total approved appropriations (Ohio Rev. Code §§ 5705.38 and 5705.40) plus any carryover appropriations for the years ended December 31, 2023 and 2022 for the General, Motor Vehicle License Tax and Permissive Motor Vehicle License Tax as recorded in the Appropriation Status Report. Expenditure did not exceed appropriations.
2. We inspected the Cash Summary by Fund Report for the years ended December 31, 2023 and 2022 for negative cash fund balances. Ohio Rev. Code § 5705.10 (I) provides that money paid into a fund must be used for the purposes for which such fund is established. As a result, a negative fund cash balance indicates that money from one fund was used to cover the expenses of another. No funds has a negative cash fund balance.

Sunshine Law Compliance

1. We obtained and inspected the Township's Public Records Policy to determine the policy was in accordance with Ohio Rev. Code §§ 149.43(E)(2) and 149.43(B)(7)(c) and did not limit the number of responses that may be made to a particular person, limit the number of responses during a specified period of time, or establish a fixed period of time before it will respond unless that period is less than eight hours. We found no exceptions.
2. We inquired with Township management and determined that the Township did not have any completed, denied or redacted public records requests during the engagement period.
3. We inquired whether the Township had a records retention schedule and observed that it was readily available to the public as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(B)(2). We found no exceptions.
4. We inspected written evidence that the Public Records Policy was provided to the records custodian/manager as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(E)(2). We found no exceptions.
5. We inspected the Township's policy manual and determined the public records policy was included as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(E)(2). We found no exceptions.
6. We observed that the Township's poster describing their Public Records Policy was displayed conspicuously in all branches of the Township as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(E)(2). We found no exceptions.

Sunshine Law Compliance (Continued)

7. We selected the only two applications submitted to the Records Commission for one-time disposal of obsolete records, and management's review of the schedules of records retention and dispositions for the engagement period. We inspected the approval by the Records Commission for the two selected and the review of the schedules. This was required by Ohio Rev. Code §149.412. We found no exceptions.
8. We inspected individual proof of attendance and determined whether each elected official in accordance with Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(E)(1) (or his/her designee) successfully attended a certified three-hour Public Records Training for each term of office as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 109.43(B). We found no exceptions.
9. We inspected the public notices for the public meetings held during the engagement period and determined the Township notified the general public and news media of when and where meetings during the engagement period were to be held as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 121.22(F). We found no exceptions.
10. We inspected the minutes of public meetings during the engagement period in accordance with Ohio Rev. Code § 121.22(C) and determined whether they were:
 - a. Prepared – a file is created following the date of the meeting
 - b. Filed – placed with similar documents in an organized manner
 - c. Maintained - retained, at a minimum, for the engagement period
 - d. Open to public inspection – available for public viewing or request.We found no exceptions.
11. We inspected the minutes from the engagement period in accordance with Ohio Rev. Code § 121.22(G) and determined the following:
 - a. Executive sessions were only held at regular or special meetings.
 - b. The purpose for the meetings and going into an executive session (when applicable) correlated with one of the matters listed in Ohio Rev. Code § 121.22(G).
 - c. Formal governing board actions were adopted in open meetings.We found no exceptions.

Contract Compliance:

1. We inspected the Minutes/Payment Register Detail and identified the Township had expenditures subject to competitive bidding. We found no exceptions.
2. We selected 1 contract subject to competitive bidding requirements for 2023 and 1 for 2022 and
 - a. We inspected the contract and other bids for the contracted expenditure and determined:
 - i. The Township accepted the lowest bid and met the requirements of Ohio Rev. Code §5575.01.
 - ii. No bid splitting occurred
 - iii. No deliberate attempts to evade bid limitations occurred, such as successive contracts just under the bid amount, occurred.
 - iv. No apparent interest in the contract by a public official occurred.We found one exception. Ohio Rev. Code § 5575.01 requires competitive bidding for Contracts for the maintenance or repair of roads, where the amount involved exceeds \$45,000. The board must advertise once, not later than two weeks prior to the letting of the contract, in a newspaper of general circulation in the township. Award must be to the lowest responsible bidder. The Township had one project over the threshold but did not competitively bid the project.

Other Compliance

1. Ohio Rev. Code § 117.38 requires townships to file their financial information in the HINKLE system within 60 days after the close of the fiscal year. This statute also permits the Auditor of State to extend the deadline for filing a financial report and establish terms and conditions for any such extension. Auditor of State established policies regarding the filing of complete financial statements, as defined in AOS Bulletin 2015-007 in the Hinkle System. We confirmed the Township filed their complete financial statements, as defined by AOS Bulletin 2015-007 and Auditor of State established policy, within the allotted timeframe for the years ended December 31, 2023 and 2022 in the Hinkle system. We found no exceptions.
2. The Township provided out-of-pocket insurance reimbursements in lieu of providing coverage to all employees.
 - a. We inspected the resolution authorizing reimbursements and determined it met the following documentation requirements for Ohio Rev. Code § 505.601.
 1. The Township has not chosen to procure a health plan,
 2. The Township has chosen to reimburse its officers and employees for each out-of-pocket premium,
 3. It provides for a maximum uniform monthly or yearly payment amount for each officer and employee, and
 4. It lists only the specific benefits allowed under Ohio Rev. Code § 505.60A that will be reimbursed.We found no exceptions.

We were engaged by the Township to perform this agreed-upon procedures engagement and conducted our engagement in accordance with the attestation standards established by the AICPA and the Comptroller General of the United States' *Government Auditing Standards*. We were not engaged to, and did not conduct an examination or review engagement, the objective of which would be the expression of an opinion or conclusion, respectively, on the Township's receipts, disbursements, balances and compliance with certain laws and regulations. Accordingly, we do not express an opinion or conclusion. Had we performed additional procedures, other matters might have come to our attention that would have been reported to you.

We are required to be independent of the Township and to meet our ethical responsibilities, in accordance with the ethical requirements established by the Comptroller General of the United States' *Government Auditing Standards* related to our agreed upon procedures engagement.



Keith Faber
Auditor of State
Columbus, Ohio

October 25, 2024

This page intentionally left blank.

OHIO AUDITOR OF STATE KEITH FABER



MADISON TOWNSHIP

CLARK COUNTY

AUDITOR OF STATE OF OHIO CERTIFICATION

This is a true and correct copy of the report, which is required to be filed pursuant to Section 117.26, Revised Code, and which is filed in the Office of the Ohio Auditor of State in Columbus, Ohio.



Certified for Release 11/12/2024

65 East State Street, Columbus, Ohio 43215
Phone: 614-466-4514 or 800-282-0370

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at
www.ohioauditor.gov