



OHIO AUDITOR OF STATE
KEITH FABER



OHIO AUDITOR OF STATE KEITH FABER

65 East State Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
ContactUs@ohioauditor.gov
800-282-0370

INDEPENDENT ACCOUNTANT'S REPORT ON APPLYING AGREED-UPON PROCEDURES

Kathy Bennett, Director/Fiscal Officer
Columbiana Public Library
Columbiana County
332 North Middle Street
Columbiana, Ohio 44408

We have performed the procedures enumerated below on the Columbiana Public Library's (the Library) receipts, disbursements and balances recorded in the cash basis accounting records for the years ended December 31, 2024 and 2023 and certain compliance requirements related to those transactions and balances, included in the information provided to us by the management of the Library. The Library is responsible for the receipts, disbursements and balances recorded in the cash basis accounting records for the years ended December 31, 2024 and 2023 and certain compliance requirements related to these transactions and balances included in the information provided to us by the Library.

The Board of Trustees and the management of the Library have agreed to and acknowledged that the procedures performed are appropriate to meet the intended purpose of providing assistance in the evaluation of the Library's receipts, disbursements and balances recorded in their cash-basis accounting records for the years ended December 31, 2024 and 2023, and certain compliance requirements related to these transactions and balances. No other party acknowledged the appropriateness of the procedures. This report may not be suitable for any other purpose. The procedures performed may not address all the items of interest to a user of the report and may not meet the needs of all users of the report and, as such, users are responsible for determining whether the procedures performed are appropriate for their purposes. The sufficiency of the procedures is solely the responsibility of the parties specified in the report. Consequently, we make no representation regarding the sufficiency of the procedures described below either for the purpose for which this report has been requested or for any other purpose.

For the purposes of performing these procedures, this report only describes exceptions exceeding \$10.

The procedures and the associated findings are as follows:

Cash and Investments

1. We recalculated the December 31, 2024 and December 31, 2023 bank reconciliations. We found no exceptions.
2. We agreed the January 1, 2023 beginning fund balances for each fund recorded in the Cash Summary by Fund Report to the December 31, 2022 balances in the prior year documentation in the prior year Agreed-Upon Procedures working papers. We found no exceptions. We also agreed the January 1, 2024 beginning fund balances for each fund recorded in the Cash Summary by Fund Report to the December 31, 2023 balances in the Cash Summary by Fund Report. We found no exceptions.

3. We agreed the 2024 and 2023 bank reconciliation adjusted UAN Balances and Adjusted Bank Balances as of December 31, 2024 and 2023 to the total fund cash balances reported in the Cash Summary by Fund Report and the financial statements filed by the Library in the Hinkle System. The amounts agreed.
4. We confirmed the December 31, 2024 bank account balances with the Library's financial institution and Ohio Pooled Collateral System. We found no exceptions. We also agreed the confirmed balances to the amounts appearing in the December 31, 2024 bank reconciliation, we noted a \$40 variance due to petty cash.
5. We selected 5 reconciling debits (such as outstanding checks) from the December 31, 2024 bank reconciliation:
 - a. We traced each debit to the subsequent January bank statement. We found two checks have been outstanding longer than 90 days and have not cleared the bank as of January 2025.
 - b. We traced the amounts and dates to the check register and determined the debits were dated prior to December 31. We found no exceptions.
6. We inspected investments held at December 31, 2024 and December 31, 2023 to determine that they:
 - a. Were of a type authorized by Ohio Rev. Code §§ 135.13, 135.14, 135.144 or 135.145. We found no exceptions.
 - b. Mature within the prescribed time limits noted in Ohio Rev. Code § 135.13 or 135.14. We found no exceptions.

Public Library Fund and Other Confirmable Cash Receipts

1. We selected a total of five Public Library Fund (PLF) receipts from the Columbiana County and Mahoning County Auditor's Distribution Transaction Lists from 2024 and a total of five from 2023.
 - a. We compared the amount from the County Auditor Distribution Transaction Lists to the amount recorded in the Receipt Register Report. The amounts agreed.
 - b. We inspected the Receipt Register Report to determine these receipts were allocated to the proper fund. We found no exceptions.
 - c. We inspected the Receipt Register Report to determine whether the receipt was recorded in the proper year. The receipt was recorded in the proper year. We found no exceptions.
2. We inspected the Receipt Register Report to determine whether it included 2 Public Library Fund receipt per month for 2024 and 2023. We found no exceptions.

Other Receipts

We selected 10 other receipts from the year ended December 31, 2024 and 10 other receipts from the year ended 2023 and:

- a. Agreed the receipt amount recorded in the Receipt Register Report to supporting documentation. The amounts agreed.
- b. Confirmed the amounts charged complied with rates in force during the period. We found no exceptions.
- c. Inspected the Receipt Register Report to determine the receipt was posted to the proper funds and was recorded in the proper year. We found no exceptions.

Debt

1. The prior audit report disclosed no debt outstanding as of December 31, 2022.

2. We inquired of management and inspected the Receipt Register Report and Payment Register Detail Report for evidence of debt issued during 2024 or 2023 or debt payment activity during 2024 or 2023. There were no new debt issuances, nor any debt payment activity during 2024 or 2023.

Payroll Cash Disbursements

1. We selected 1 payroll check for 5 employees from 2024 and 1 payroll check for 5 employees from 2023 from the Wage Detail Report and:
 - a. We compared the hours and pay rate, or salary recorded in the Wage Detail Report to supporting documentation (timecard). We found no exceptions.
 - b. We inspected the fund and account codes to which the check was posted to determine the posting was allowable based on the employees' duties as documented in the employees' personnel files. We found no exceptions.
 - c. We confirmed the payment was posted to the proper year. We found no exceptions.
2. We selected all new employees from 2024 and 2023 and:
 - a. We inspected the employees' personnel files for the Retirement system, Federal, State & Local income tax withholding authorization.
 - b. We agreed the items in a above to the Employee General Information Report
 We found no exceptions.
3. We inspected the last remittance of tax and retirement withholdings for the year ended December 31, 2024 to confirm remittances were timely paid, and if the amounts paid agreed to the amounts withheld, plus the employer's share where applicable, during the final withholding period of 2024. We observed the following:

Withholding (plus employer share, where applicable)	Date Due	Date Paid	Amount Due	Amount Paid
Federal income taxes & Medicare (and social security, for employees not enrolled in pension system)	January 31, 2025	December 31, 2024	\$3,881	\$3,881
State income taxes	January 15, 2025	December 31, 2024	\$829	\$829
Columbiana local income tax	February 10, 2025	December 31, 2024	\$480	\$480
East Palestine local income tax	February 10, 2025	December 31, 2024	\$15	\$15
OPERS retirement	January 30, 2025	January 22, 2025	\$10,565	\$10,565

We found no exceptions.

Non-Payroll Cash Disbursements

1. We selected 10 disbursements from the Payment Register Detail Report for the year ended December 31, 2024 and 10 from the year ended 2023 and determined whether:
 - a. The disbursements were for a proper public purpose. We found no exceptions.
 - b. The check number, date, payee name and amount recorded on the returned, canceled check/ACH agreed to the check number, date, payee name and amount recorded in the Payment Register Detail Report and to the names and amounts on the supporting invoices. We found no exceptions.
 - c. The payment was posted to a fund consistent with the restricted purpose for which the fund's cash can be used. We found no exceptions.

Transfers

1. We inspected the interfund transfer from 2024 and 2023 Revenue Status Reports and Appropriation Status Reports and the transfers:
 - a. Were properly authorized. We found no exceptions.
 - b. Were transferred to the correct fund. We found no exceptions.
 - c. Were recorded at the correct amounts. We found no exceptions.

Compliance – Budgetary

1. Ohio Admin. Code 117-8-02 prohibits spending in excess of budgeted amounts. We compared total expenditures to total approved appropriations plus any carryover appropriations for the years ended December 31, 2024 and 2023 for the General, PLUS and Vogleson funds. Expenditures did not exceed appropriations.

Sunshine Law Compliance

1. We obtained and inspected the Library's Public Records Policy to determine the policy was in accordance with Ohio Rev. Code §§ 149.43(E)(2) and 149.43(B)(7)(c) and did not limit the number of responses that may be made to a particular person, limit the number of responses during a specified period of time, or establish a fixed period of time before it will respond unless that period is less than eight hours. We found no exceptions.
2. We selected one public records requests from the engagement period and inspected the request to determine the following:
 - a. The Library was compliant and responded to the request in accordance with their adopted policy as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(B)(1). We found no exceptions.

Date Request Received	Date Request Fulfilled	Policy Response Time (in Business days)	Actual Response Time (in Business days)
March 20, 2023	March 24, 2023	Reasonable period of time depending upon items requested	4

- b. The Library did not have any denied public records requests during the engagement period.
 - c. The Library did not have any public records requests with redactions during the engagement period.
3. We inquired whether the Library had a records retention schedule and observed that it was readily available to the public as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(B)(2). We found no exceptions.
4. We inspected written evidence that the Public Records Policy was provided to the records custodian/manager as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(E)(2). We found no exceptions.
5. We inspected the Library's policy manual and determined the public records policy was included as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(E)(2). We found no exceptions.
6. We observed that the Library's poster describing their Public Records Policy was displayed conspicuously in all branches of the Library as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(E)(2). We found no exceptions.

7. We selected one application submitted to the Records Commission for one-time disposal of obsolete records, and management's review of the schedules of records retention and dispositions for the engagement period. We inspected the approval by the Records Commission for the one selected and the review of the schedules. This was required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.411. We found no exceptions.
8. We inquired with Library management and determined that the Library did not have any elected officials subject to the Public Records Training requirements during the engagement period as required by Ohio Rev. Code §§ 149.43(E)(1) and 109.43(B).
9. We inspected the public notices for the public meetings held during the engagement period and determined the Library notified the general public and news media of when and where meetings during the engagement period were to be held as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 121.22(F). We found no exceptions.
10. We inspected the minutes of public meetings during the engagement period in accordance with Ohio Rev. Code § 121.22(C) and determined whether they were:
 - a. Prepared – a file is created following the date of the meeting
 - b. Filed – placed with similar documents in an organized manner
 - c. Maintained - retained, at a minimum, for the engagement period
 - d. Open to public inspection – available for public viewing or request.We found no exceptions.
11. We inspected the minutes from the engagement period in accordance with Ohio Rev. Code § 121.22(G) and determined the following:
 - a. Executive sessions were only held at regular or special meetings.
 - b. The purpose for the meetings and going into an executive session (when applicable) correlated with one of the matters listed in Ohio Rev. Code § 121.22(G).
 - c. Formal governing board actions were adopted in open meetings.We found no exceptions.

Contract Compliance:

1. We inspected the Payment Register Ledger and identified the Library had expenditures subject to competitive bidding. We found no exceptions.
2. We selected 1 contract subject to competitive bidding requirements for construction expenditures for 2024 and:
 - a. We inspected the sealed bids and board minutes for the contracted expenditure and determined the sealed bids were:
 - i. Opened at the next meeting of the board
 - ii. Publicly read by the fiscal officer
 - iii. Entered into the board's recordsWe found no exceptions.
 - b. We inspected the advertisements of the proposals for bids in the newspaper and determined they were made as required by Ohio Rev. Code §§ 3375.41 and 7.16. We found no exceptions.

Other Compliance

1. Ohio Rev. Code § 117.38 requires libraries to file their financial information in the HINKLE system within 60 days after the close of the fiscal year. This statute also permits the Auditor of State to extend the deadline for filing a financial report and establish terms and conditions for any such extension. Auditor of State established policies regarding the filing of complete financial statements, as defined in AOS Bulletin 2015-007 in the Hinkle System. We confirmed the Library:
 - a. Filed their complete financial statements, as defined by AOS Bulletin 2015-007 and Auditor of State established policy within the allotted timeframe for the years ended December 31, 2024 and 2023 in the Hinkle system. We found no exceptions.
 - b. Prepared their financial statements following the prescribed program codes in effect for December 31, 2024. We found no exceptions.

We were engaged by the Library to perform this agreed-upon procedures engagement and conducted our engagement in accordance with the attestation standards established by the AICPA and the Comptroller General of the United States' *Government Auditing Standards*. We were not engaged to, and did not conduct an examination, or review engagement, the objective of which would be the expression of an opinion or conclusion, respectively on the Library's receipts, disbursements, balances and compliance with certain laws and regulations. Accordingly, we do not express an opinion or conclusion. Had we performed additional procedures, other matters might have come to our attention that would have been reported to you.

We are required to be independent of the Library and to meet our ethical responsibilities, in accordance with the ethical requirements established by the Comptroller General of the United States' *Government Auditing Standards* related to our agreed upon procedures engagement.

KEITH FABER
Ohio Auditor of State



Tiffany L. Ridenbaugh, CPA, CFE, CGFM
Chief Deputy Auditor

October 29, 2025

OHIO AUDITOR OF STATE KEITH FABER



COLUMBIANA PUBLIC LIBRARY

COLUMBIANA COUNTY

AUDITOR OF STATE OF OHIO CERTIFICATION

This is a true and correct copy of the report, which is required to be filed pursuant to Section 117.26, Revised Code, and which is filed in the Office of the Ohio Auditor of State in Columbus, Ohio.



Certified for Release 11/20/2025

65 East State Street, Columbus, Ohio 43215
Phone: 614-466-4514 or 800-282-0370

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at
www.ohioauditor.gov