



OHIO AUDITOR OF STATE
KEITH FABER



OHIO AUDITOR OF STATE KEITH FABER



88 East Broad Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
ContactUs@ohioauditor.gov
(800) 282-0370

INDEPENDENT ACCOUNTANT'S REPORT ON APPLYING AGREED-UPON PROCEDURES

West Township
Columbiana County
8610 Knox School Rd.
Minerva, Ohio 44657

We have performed the procedures enumerated below on the West Township's (the Township) receipts, disbursements and balances recorded in the cash basis accounting records for the years ended December 31, 2021 and 2020 and certain compliance requirements related to those transactions and balances, included in the information provided to us by the management of the Township. The Township is responsible for the receipts, disbursements and balances recorded in the cash basis accounting records for the years ended December 31, 2021 and 2020 and certain compliance requirements related to these transactions and balances included in the information provided to us by the Township.

The Board of Trustees and the management of the Township have agreed to and acknowledged that the procedures performed are appropriate to meet the intended purpose of providing assistance in the evaluation of the Township's receipts, disbursements and balances recorded in their cash-basis accounting records for the years ended December 31, 2021 and 2020, and certain compliance requirements related to these transactions and balances. No other party acknowledged the appropriateness of the procedures. This report may not be suitable for any other purpose. The procedures performed may not address all the items of interest to a user of the report and may not meet the needs of all users of the report and, as such, users are responsible for determining whether the procedures performed are appropriate for their purposes. The sufficiency of the procedures is solely the responsibility of the parties specified in the report. Consequently, we make no representation regarding the sufficiency of the procedures described below either for the purpose for which this report has been requested or for any other purpose.

For the purposes of performing these procedures, this report only describes exceptions exceeding \$10.

The procedures and the associated findings are as follows:

Cash and Investments

1. We recalculated the December 31, 2021 and December 31, 2020 bank reconciliations. We found no exceptions.
2. We agreed the January 1, 2020 beginning fund balances recorded in the Fund Ledger Report to the December 31, 2019 balances in the prior year audited statements. We found no exceptions. We also agreed the January 1, 2021 beginning fund balances recorded in the Fund Ledger Report to the December 31, 2020 balances in the Fund Ledger Report. January 1, 2021 beginning fund balances were \$208.80 higher than December 31, 2020 ending fund balances. The difference is attributable to a check written in 2020, voided in 2021.

3. We agreed the 2021 and 2020 Bank Reconciliation adjusted UAN Balances and Adjusted Bank Balances as of December 31, 2021 and 2020 to the total fund cash balances reported in the Fund Status Report and the financial statements filed by the Township in the Hinkle System. The amounts agreed.
4. We confirmed the December 31, 2021 bank account balances with the Ohio Pooled Collateral System. We found no exceptions. We also agreed the confirmed balances to the amounts appearing in the December 31, 2021 bank reconciliation without exception.
5. We selected five reconciling debits (such as outstanding checks) from the December 31, 2021 bank reconciliation:
 - a. We traced each debit to the subsequent January bank statement. We found no exceptions.
 - b. We traced the amounts and dates to the check register, and determined the debits were dated prior to December 31. We found no exceptions.
6. We inspected investments held at December 31, 2021 and December 31, 2020 to determine that they:
 - a. Were of a type authorized by Ohio Rev. Code § 135.13, 135.14 or 135.144. We found no exceptions
 - b. Mature within the prescribed time limits noted in Ohio Rev. Code § 135.13 or 135.14. We found no exceptions.

Property Taxes, and Intergovernmental Receipts

1. We selected a total of five receipts from the *Statement of Semiannual Apportionment of Taxes*, State Distribution Transaction Lists (DTL), and the Columbiana County Auditor Cross Reference Report by Vendor Number for 2021 and a total of five from 2020:
 - a. We compared the amount from the above named reports to the amount recorded in the Receipt Register Report. The amounts agreed.
 - b. We inspected the Receipt Register Report to determine these receipts were allocated to the proper funds as required by Ohio Rev. Code §§ 5705.05-.06 and 5705.10. We found no exceptions.
 - c. We inspected the Receipt Register Report to determine whether the receipt was recorded in the proper year. The receipt was recorded in the proper year. We found no exceptions.
2. We inspected the Receipt Register Report to determine whether it included two real estate tax receipts plus 6 advances for 2021 and 2020. We noted one Homestead and Rollback real estate receipt in 2020 totaling \$531.82 and one in 2021 totaling \$516.76 which were misclassified as property tax revenue rather than intergovernmental revenue.

Other Receipts

We selected 10 other receipts from the year ended December 31, 2020 and:

- a. Agreed the receipt amount recorded in the Receipt Register Report to supporting documentation. The amounts agreed.
- b. Confirmed the amounts charged complied with rates in force during the period. We found no exceptions.
- c. Inspected the Receipt Register Report to determine the receipt was posted to the proper fund, and was recorded in the proper year. We found no exceptions.

Debt

1. From the prior audit documentation, we observed the following bonds were outstanding as of December 31, 2019. These amounts agreed to the Townships January 1, 2020 balances on the summary we used in procedure 3.

Issue	Principal outstanding as of December 31, 2019:
USDA Rural Development	\$68,000

2. We inquired of management, and inspected the Receipt Register Report and Payment Register Detail Report for evidence of debt issued during 2021 or 2020 or debt payment activity during 2021 or 2020. All debt agreed to the summary we used in procedure 3.
3. We obtained a summary of bond debt activity for 2021 and 2020 and agreed principal and interest payments from the related debt amortization schedules to Road District fund payments reported in the Payment Register Detail Report. We also compared the date the debt service payments were due to the date the Township made the payments. We found no exceptions.
4. We agreed the amount of debt proceeds received for 2020 from the debt documents to amounts recorded in the Road District fund per the Receipt Register Report. The amounts agreed. The Township did not properly record the proceeds in a bond fund (i.e. capital projects fund) as required by Ohio Rev. Code Section 5705.09(E).
5. For new debt issued during 2020, we inspected the debt legislation, which stated the Township must use the proceeds to purchase a John Deere 6110M Tractor with a Tiger side-mount. We inspected the Payment Register Detail Report and observed the Township purchased the Tractor with side-mount in August of 2020.

Payroll Cash Disbursements

1. We selected one payroll check for five employees from 2021 and one payroll check for five employees from 2020 from the Wage Withholdings Detail Report and:
 - a. We compared the hours and pay rate, or salary recorded in the Wage Detail Report to supporting documentation (timecard, legislatively or statutorily-approved rate or salary).
 - i. We inspected the employees' personnel files for the Retirement system, Federal, State & Local income tax withholding authorization.
 - ii. We agreed these items to the information used to compute gross and net pay related to this check.
We found no exceptions.
 - b. We inspected the fund and account codes to which the check was posted to determine the posting was allowable based on the employees' duties as documented in the minute record. We found no exceptions.
 - c. We confirmed the payment was posted to the proper year. We found no exceptions.
2. We inspected the last remittance of tax and retirement withholdings for the year ended December 31, 2021 to confirm remittances were timely paid, and if the amounts paid agreed to the amounts withheld, plus the employer's share where applicable, during the final withholding period of 2021. We observed the following:

Withholding (plus employer share, where applicable)	Date Due	Date Paid	Amount Due	Amount Paid
Federal income taxes & Medicare (and social security, for employees not enrolled in pension system)	January 31, 2022	December 31, 2021	\$2,551.84	\$2,551.84
State income taxes	January 15, 2022	December 31, 2021	\$389.86	\$389.86
OPERS retirement	January 30, 2022	December 31, 2021	\$3,063.85	\$3,063.85

We found no exceptions.

3. We compared total gross pay for the fiscal officer and each board member for 2021 and 2020 to the compensation permitted by Ohio Revised Code §§ 507.09 and 505.24, respectively. We found the Fiscal Officer was under compensated by \$339 in 2021.
4. We inquired of management and inspected the Payment Register Detail Report for the years ended December 31, 2021 and 2020 to determine if township employees and/or trustees were reimbursed for out-of-pocket insurance premiums. No such reimbursements occurred.

Non-Payroll Cash Disbursements

1. We selected 10 disbursements from the Payment Register Detail Report for the year ended December 31, 2021 and 10 from the year ended 2020 and determined whether:
 - a. The disbursements were for a proper public purpose. We found no exceptions.
 - b. The check number, date, payee name and amount recorded on the returned, canceled check agreed to the check number, date, payee name and amount recorded in the Payment Register Detail Report and to the names and amounts on the supporting invoices. We found no exceptions.
 - c. The payment was posted to a fund consistent with the restricted purpose for which the fund's cash can be used. We found one instance of a fund's monies being used for a purpose not consistent with which the fund is for.

During 2020 and 2021, the Township expended \$5,184 for UAN software fees out of the Motor Vehicle License fund, however, during 2020 and 2021, \$2,218 and \$2,831, respectively, should have been expended from the General fund or other funds. Ohio Rev. Code § 5705.10 restricts the use of monies spent out of the Motor Vehicle License fund.

We brought this to management's attention. They corrected the Motor Vehicle License fund and General fund balances for this item. However, because we did not inspect all disbursements, our report provides no assurance regarding whether or not other similar errors occurred.

- d. The fiscal officer certified disbursements requiring certification or issued a *Then and Now Certificate*, as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 5705.41(D). We found no exceptions.

Compliance – Budgetary

1. Ohio Rev. Code § 5705.41(B) prohibits expenditures (disbursements plus certified commitments) from exceeding appropriations. We compared total expenditures to total approved appropriations (Ohio Rev. Code §§ 5705.38 and 5705.40) plus any carryover appropriations for the years ended December 31, 2021 and 2020 for the General, Gasoline Tax and Coronavirus Relief funds as recorded in the Appropriation Status Report. Expenditures did not exceed appropriations.

2. We inspected the Appropriation Ledger Report for the 4951 Permanent and 4952 Permanent Funds. Not more than 5% of non-spendable monies were released, spent, or otherwise modified during the engagement period.
3. We inspected the Cash Summary by Fund Report for the years ended December 31, 2021 and 2020 for negative cash fund balances. Ohio Rev. Code § 5705.10 (I) provides that money paid into a fund must be used for the purposes for which such fund is established. As a result, a negative fund cash balance indicates that money from one fund was used to cover the expenses of another. No funds had a negative cash fund balances.

Sunshine Law Compliance

1. We obtained and inspected the Township's Public Records Policy to determine the policy was in accordance with Ohio Rev. Code §§ 149.43(E)(2) and 149.43(B)(7)(c) and did not limit the number of responses that may be made to a particular person, limit the number of responses during a specified period of time, or establish a fixed period of time before it will respond unless that period is less than eight hours. We found no exceptions.
2. We selected all public records requests from the engagement period and inspected each request to determine the following:
 - a. The Township was compliant and responded to the request in accordance with their adopted policy as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(B)(1). We found no exceptions.

Date Request Received	Date Request Fulfilled	Policy Response Time (in Business days)	Actual Response Time (in Business days)
2/4/21	2/9/21	Reasonable Time	3

- b. The Township did not have any denied public records requests during the engagement period.
 - c. The Township did not have any public records requests with redactions during the engagement period.
3. We inquired whether the Township had a records retention schedule, and observed that it was readily available to the public as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(B)(2). We found no exceptions.
4. We inspected written evidence that the Public Records Policy was provided to the records custodian/manager as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(E)(2). We found no exceptions.
5. We inquired with Township management and determined that the Township did not have a policy manual during the engagement period therefore the public records policy could not be included as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(E)(2).
6. We observed that the Township's poster describing their Public Records Policy was displayed conspicuously in all branches of the Township as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(E)(2). We found no exceptions.
7. We inquired with Township management and determined that the Township did not have any applications for record disposal submitted to the Records Commission during the engagement period.
8. We inspected individual proof of attendance and determined whether each elected official in accordance with Ohio Rev. Code § 149.43(E)(1) (or his/her designee) successfully attended a certified three-hour Public Records Training for each term of office as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 109.43(B). Two trustees with terms running January 1, 2018 to December 31, 2021 did not

provide evidence of attendance at a certified public records training or that they appointed a designee to attend in their place.

9. We inspected the public notices for the public meetings held during the engagement period and determined the Township notified the general public and news media of when and where meetings during the engagement period were to be held as required by Ohio Rev. Code § 121.22(F). We found no exceptions.
10. We inspected the minutes of public meetings during the engagement period in accordance with Ohio Rev. Code § 121.22(C) and determined whether they were:
 - a. Prepared – a file is created following the date of the meeting
 - b. Filed – placed with similar documents in an organized manner
 - c. Maintained - retained, at a minimum, for the engagement period
 - d. Open to public inspection – available for public viewing or request.We found no exceptions.
11. We inspected the minutes from the engagement period in accordance with Ohio Rev. Code § 121.22(G) and determined the following:
 - a. Executive sessions were only held at regular or special meetings.
 - b. The purpose for the meetings and going into an executive session (when applicable) correlated with one of the matters listed in Ohio Rev. Code § 121.22(G).
 - c. Formal governing board actions were adopted in open meetings.We found no exceptions.

HB 481 / HB 614 Coronavirus Relief Fund (CRF) Compliance

1. We inquired of management and those charged with governance and documented how the Township decided to spend their CRF allocations and how the Township documented their compliance with the CARES Act three-prong test. We then selected five transactions including payroll, non-payroll, and subgrant/subloan transactions. and determined the Township:
 - a. Spent the CRF money (including additional distributions or redistributions) in accordance with use of funds requirements and
 - b. Maintained appropriate supporting documentation.Five out of five (100%) of the expenditures selected, did have support for how the Township documented their compliance with the CARES Act three-prong test..
2. We recalculated the unencumbered balance the local government paid back to the county treasurer and determined the proper amount was repaid. We also compared the date of the repayment to the required date of November 20, 2020 and determined the payment was made in a timely manner. We found no exceptions.

Contract Compliance:

1. We inspected the Minutes and Payment Listing and identified the Township had expenditures subject to competitive bidding. Refer to step 2.
2. We selected one contract over \$50,000 for 2021 and one for 2020 and
 - a. We inspected the contract and other bids for the contracted expenditure and determined:
 - i. The Township accepted the lowest bid and met the requirements of Ohio Rev. Code §5549.21.
 - ii. No bid splitting occurred
 - iii. No deliberate attempts to evade bid limitations occurred, such as successive contracts just under the bid amount, occurred.
 - iv. No apparent interest in the contract by a public official occurred.

The Township purchased a John Deere 6330 Tractor for \$52,000 in 2021. Competitive bidding procedures were not followed for the purchase and the purchase was not made using a joint purchasing contract or through another entity's purchasing program.

Other Compliance

1. Ohio Rev. Code § 117.38 requires townships to file their financial information in the HINKLE system within 60 days after the close of the fiscal year. This statute also permits the Auditor of State to extend the deadline for filing a financial report and establish terms and conditions for any such extension. Auditor of State established policies regarding the filing of complete financial statements, as defined in AOS Bulletin 2015-007 in the Hinkle System. We confirmed the Township filed their complete financial statements, as defined by AOS Bulletin 2015-007 and Auditor of State established policy, within the allotted timeframe for the years ended December 31, 2021 and 2020 in the Hinkle system. We found no exceptions.
2. We inquired of the fiscal officer to determine whether the fiscal officer obtained the training required by Ohio Rev. Code §§ 507.12 and 733.81. Fiscal Officer obtained the required training.

Related Party Transactions

1. We inquired with management and identified the following Related Party Transactions:
 - a. Check #19137 for \$604.00 purchase of 2 dump truck tires from Whiteleather Trucking LLC dated March 2, 2020.
 - b. Check #19525 for \$61.84 purchase of trigger gun for pressure washer from Whiteleather Grain LLC dated December 14, 2020.We found no exceptions.
2. We confirmed the transactions with the other party. We found no exceptions.
3. We obtained supporting evidence for the Related Party Transactions identified in procedure 1. We found no exceptions.

We were engaged by the Township to perform this agreed-upon procedures engagement and conducted our engagement in accordance with the attestation standards established by the AICPA and the Comptroller General of the United States' *Government Auditing Standards*. We were not engaged to, and did not conduct an examination or review engagement, the objective of which would be the expression of an opinion or conclusion, respectively, on the Township's receipts, disbursements, balances and compliance with certain laws and regulations. Accordingly, we do not express an opinion or conclusion. Had we performed additional procedures, other matters might have come to our attention that would have been reported to you.

We are required to be independent of the Township and to meet our ethical responsibilities, in accordance with the ethical requirements established by the Comptroller General of the United States' *Government Auditing Standards* related to our agreed upon procedures engagement.



Keith Faber
Auditor of State
Columbus, Ohio

August 26, 2022

This page intentionally left blank.

OHIO AUDITOR OF STATE KEITH FABER



**WEST TOWNSHIP
COLUMBIANA COUNTY**

AUDITOR OF STATE OF OHIO CERTIFICATION

This is a true and correct copy of the report, which is required to be filed pursuant to Section 117.26, Revised Code, and which is filed in the Office of the Ohio Auditor of State in Columbus, Ohio.



Certified for Release 10/4/2022

88 East Broad Street, Columbus, Ohio 43215
Phone: 614-466-4514 or 800-282-0370

This report is a matter of public record and is available online at
www.ohioauditor.gov